

M&O Department Comprehensive Exam Policy

The comprehensive exam includes submission of a written paper as well as an oral defense of that paper to the student's dissertation committee.

Written paper: Due by Oct. 1 of the third year. The written paper should comprise the student's original empirical research written in the style of a top tier journal paper submission. The paper should have the potential to make a significant contribution to the literature and should be in crafted in such a way that relatively minor revisions would be needed to bring the paper up to the standard of a first submission to a top tier journal, to be evaluated using the current review criteria for the Academy of Management Journal (see below). All members of the committee must agree that the written paper is of sufficient quality to be defensible prior to an oral defense being scheduled.

Oral defense: By convention, scheduled in the Fall of the third year (no later than the end of April of third year). The oral defense of the above paper includes a 45-minute presentation of the paper by the student in a standard seminar format that is attended by the dissertation committee and open to all members of the department. Following the student's presentation, members of the dissertation committee will ask questions in two rounds, with the student answering each question, with a third round permitted if necessary and if time allows.

Following the presentation and the question period, the committee will meet separately and evaluate the student's understanding and quality of the theory/phenomena and the research design of the study.

Criteria for evaluation:

Criteria	Presentation	Question Handling & Understanding
Theoretical contribution (testing, creating, extending theory)		
Interestingness, innovativeness and novelty		
Clarity of Exposition		
Empirical Contribution		
Engages an important problem for organizations		
Potential significance of contribution		
Overall Quality		

Ratings: Completely Inadequate, Weak, Modest, Strong, Very Strong.

To pass, the student must achieve an overall quality of at least modest in both presentation and question handling/understanding and must not receive a grade of "completely inadequate" on any criterion.

Failure: Should the student's defense be deemed deficient, the student will be allowed one more attempt to defend the paper to be scheduled before the end of April of the third year.

Second Failure: Should the student's defense be deemed deficient on the second attempt, the student will be asked to leave the PhD program, but may be allowed to switch to a Master's program.

Policy on Assistance with the Paper/Presentation: The student must submit original work in the first paper submission (by October 1 of the third year) with feedback, but no revisions allowed by anyone else. The student may not present the paper in a departmental (ORG) seminar prior to the defense. After paper submission and prior to the defense, the student may work with their advisor and/or committee members to revise the paper toward journal submission, and it is acceptable for the study is under review at the point that they present it/conduct their comprehensive exam providing the student is the first author.